



STAYING WITH THE TROUBLE

CRITICAL & CREATIVE APPROACHES
TO THE BIODIVERSITY &
CLIMATE CRISES

LONDON 6 DEC 2019
Friends House, Euston Road

Image: RIP Texan Clearnose Skate from *Ghosts of the Gulf* (c) Brandon Ballengée 2014. Symposium title is from *Staying With the Trouble*, Donna J. Haraway (c) 2016, Duke University Press

Landscape Research Group
Landscape Symposium 2019

PROGRAMME

4.00-4.10pm Welcome and introduction - Chris Dalglish, Chair of LRG Board of Directors

ARRIVING

4.10-4.50pm Conversation

4.50-5.00pm Break

BELONGING

5.00-5.50pm Conversation

5.50-6.00pm Break

PRACTISING

6.00-6.20pm 'Landfill': live audio performance by sensingsite, Central St Martins

6.20-6.50pm Conversation

6.50-7.00pm Break

7.00-7.30pm Whole room discussion

7.30-7.35pm Event close - Chris Dalglish



About the Landscape Research Group

The Landscape Research Group (LRG) is an international, independent and not-for-profit organisation that promotes interdisciplinary research across boundaries.

We fund, support and share inter- and transdisciplinary landscape research with the potential to contribute towards greater justice and sustainability.

We believe that research has a vital role to play in realising a fairer, ethical and more sustainable future, in terms of the relationships that people have with the places they live, and the environments they share with each other, and with other living things.

Our current research priorities as set out in our Research Strategy are: Landscape justice; Rapid environmental change; Landscape governance; and Critical and creative landscape thinking.

What we do:

- Produce an interdisciplinary peer-reviewed journal, *Landscape Research*; the key publication for those wishing to explore, and be informed on, issues in international landscape research, practice, policy and governance
- Annual Research Fund grants scheme, for projects which link to our research themes above
- Events, including an Annual Landscape Symposium, based on our research themes
- Fund and support Landscape Research Networks, regional or thematic networks of landscape researchers and practitioners who wish to collaborate on practical work on specific themes, linked to our research themes
- Produce a secondary online publication and online space for global landscape content outwith the journal, including featuring members' work (*coming soon*)

Join the LRG community!

Join a worldwide community of interest, with opportunities to learn, meet and collaborate with others who share a common interest in landscape research and practice.

We have a growing and active membership all over the world, from Algeria to Taiwan. Our members are from many fields - architects, ecologists, archaeologists, planners, artists... - who share an interest in landscape research across boundaries.

Do consider supporting our work! More at www.landscaperesearch.org/membership

Landscape Symposium 2019

Collaborators

Amanda Thomson is a visual artist, researcher and writer, and lectures at the Glasgow School of Art. Her creative practice is ideas- and research-led and fuses traditional and digital printmaking techniques with photography, bookmaking, video and sound works and creative non-fiction. Her artwork is often about how we are located (and locate ourselves) in the world; space, place and landscape; and explorations of home, nativity, migration, mapping and how places come to be made. Her first book, *A Scots Dictionary of Nature* was published by Saraband Books in 2018.

www.passingplace.com

@passingplace

Andrew Patrizio holds the Chair of Scottish Visual Culture at Edinburgh College of Art. He focusses on two areas: Scottish post-1945 art; and ecological themes and methods. His new monograph *The Ecological Eye: Assembling An Ecocritical Art History* (Manchester University Press 2019) sets art history in a wider context of non-hierarchical politics, theory and culture. Prior to his academic career, he held curatorial posts at the Hayward Gallery, London and Glasgow Museums.

www.eca.ed.ac.uk/profile/prof-andrew-patrizio

@scovulture

Anupama Ranawana is a theologian, writer and researcher with research and teaching interests in South Asian Studies, faith and international development, liberation theology, feminist theology, race, ecological justice, feminist political thought and global political economics. Her doctoral work focuses on religious perspectives, specifically Buddhist feminist thought, as an alternative site from which to understand the international. She is presently a Visiting Researcher at Oxford Brookes University.

www.enough.scot/2019/09/20/beyond-the-lightbulbs-reflections-on-race-and-climate-justice/

@ARanawana25

George Revill is a musician and Senior Lecturer in Geography at the Open University. He has a long-standing interest in socially engaged art as educational process, geographies of transport and mobility, and geographies of communication, sound, music and auditory spaces. A forthcoming book, *Acoustic Geographies*, will bring these strands together in an exploration of acoustic geographies of space, place, landscape and environment. George was formerly a Chair of LRG.

www.soundingcoastalchange.org

@GeRevill

Lisa Garforth is Senior Lecturer in Sociology at Newcastle University where her research interests include utopian studies, environmental/Anthropocene futures, and science fiction. Her current focus is on how green futures in fiction, policy, public debate and the sociological imagination are shifting in response to climate change and the Anthropocene, which she explores in her recent book *Green Utopias: Environmental Hope Before and After Nature* (Polity 2017).

www.ncl.ac.uk/gps/staff/profile/lisagarforth.html

@dreamworlding

Ruth Little will facilitate the symposium, and works as a theatre and dance dramaturg or performance ecologist, a teacher and writer. She lectured in English literature at the University of Sydney, and was literary manager at the Young Vic and the Royal Court. She is dramaturg with Akram Khan Company and has worked with Sadlers Wells, Spitalfields Festival, and the Barbican, amongst others. Ruth was associate director at Cape Farewell from 2010-2016, a project exploring the cultural response to climate change.

www.capefarewell.com

@roolittle

sensingsite is a collective working with experimental arts-based research methods at Central St Martins, facilitated by LRG members Susan Trangmar and Steven Ball. The group is responding to the symposium themes through excavating sites along the Thames, presenting an audio performance entitled 'Landfill.'

www.sensingsite.blogspot.com

Vanessa Lastrucci has written a short blog series to accompany the event, as thought-pieces. She is a landscape architect and researcher working professionally and academically at the intersection of landscape architecture, urbanism and environmental practices.

She includes in her work process aspects and factors that have a tendency to evolve in not completely predictable ways, pursuing an approach to design that is both generous and subtle, able to embody the spontaneous developments and transformations that come with habitation, of human and non-human alike.

Happy reading!

Symposium Blog #1: Never inert, nor fixed



Roberto Mamani Mamani: Mother Illimani with Intis, Awichas and Children (oils and pastels)

Starting with a simple yet open question, what is landscape?, Tim Ingold in 'The temporality of the landscape' (1993) frames his discourse delineating what landscape is not: it is not nature, it is not space and it is not environment.

In the landscape, each component enfolds with its essence the totality of its relations with each and every other, he continues.

Perhaps landscape is all these elements at once, and more: in other words, the landscape is the relational context from which we gather meanings in the context of deep time.



This is a relational approach; however 'landscape' is a concept and word that today retains an emphasis on 'the view,' or 'the perspective.' Especially when landscape is without time, without process.

But how to speak about landscape where and when there is no word for it – if we take out the gaze?

Through my research I have been lucky enough to enter a time-space where there is no word for landscape: in Indigenous Andean worldviews 'landscape' is a concept that does not belong, and therefore cannot be translated.

Landscape does not exist, yet the relation with the land earth-beings is one of kinship.

The mountains and the streams, the volcanos and the clouds have their own selfhood and agency, they shape the world without need of the actions of humans.

Their more-than-human transformative powers not only generate environments and spaces, but also rituals and the structures of society: they are at once deities and family, and also hold the practical value as the elements that provide what sustains life.

And human beings, together with the creature beings on the land and the earth-beings form an assemblage of spiritual and material values.

It constitutes an indivisible whole which is difficult to translate in European languages and minds: there are not many words, except perhaps the vague and generalising 'holistic', to encompass this multidimensional stream of connections.

However, such lifeworld can be summarised on three guiding principles: cyclical thinking, reciprocal relation and continuous habitation (Indigenous scholar Winona LaDuke).

In the Andes, reciprocal thinking is Ayni – reciprocity, which is the law of co-dependency and interconnectedness of all living beings, humans and more-than-human alike. It implies that one cannot take without a reciprocal offer. Giving is not disinterested, but a meaningful gesture of social and cultural power: on the land earth-beings give, humans must give back.

Such a code of ethics flows from the mountain into the modes of living, forms of habitation and ways of managing the land. It represents clear and subtle knowledge with a caring potential to influence environmental planning, and how we in Europe think about landscape more at large.

Indigenous forms of knowledge had been long disregarded when they present themselves with forms and means that in the past have been considered far from specific standardised techno-scientific methods. However, their process-based and relational languages are probably best adapted to describe and understand the entangled complexities of our earth systems.



Becoming more 'native' as in 'to belong' to the land – and let it belong to us, also means speculating how a time of 'indigenous science' can infiltrate our views.

Maybe in that time-space resides the sparkle for the struggle to keep humans and everything else that walks and crawls the surface of the earth, everything that swims in the oceans and everything that flies in the air, alive on this planet.

More thoughts:

- Winona LaDuke, *Traditional Ecological Knowledge and Environmental Futures* (1994)
- Claudette Kemper *Columbus, Map, Metaphor, Topos and Toponym: some Andean Instances* (1994)
- Tim Ingold, *The Temporality of the Landscape* (1993)
- Alonso Barros, *Development and Pachamama: conflicting landscapes in the Atacama Desert* (1997)
- Donna Haraway, *Anthropocene, Capitalocene, Plantationocene, Chthulucene: Making Kin* (2015)

Symposium Blog #2: To care is to change

I have been drawn to think of care-time as that which cohabits but remains imperceptible from the perspective of anticipatory futuristic science.

Maria Puig de la Bellacasa

Climate change is a manmade problem, with a feminist solution.

Mary Robinson

The two capsules of thought by Maria Puig de la Bellacasa and Mary Robinson are extrinsically linked by a male-dominance legacy that both authors are critiquing in the extent of their works: the idea of care as an engendered act, care as a quintessentially female action.

Feminist thinkers discussed and contested all the possible ways in which the practices of caring was and still largely is borne by women, whether it is care towards the young, the elderly, other humans and other-than-humans we decide to share our intimacy with; or towards our own belongings and mundane objects, kitchen gardens, trees, open spaces, territories, regions, and landscapes to which we are affectionate.

Staying with such laborious practices of maintenance requires daily dedication and regularity, repetitiveness and reiteration of the tasks at work. Getting one's hands dirty.

Care is founded on re-production, maintenance and repair, and on making time to complete such actions: all labour not considered valuable as a techno-scientific asset, and therefore invisible.

In this bundle of practices, ecological (or environmental) care does not differ from others forms of care: at its core, ecological care needs continuous every-day performance and attention to the processes of re-creation of the land and its forms of life; and to tune into their temporal needs.

Environmental care, it seems to me, cannot be restrained within the frames of an abstract definition, but it is at once extremely situated and extremely dynamic. Its transformative potential resides in being both rooted and flexible.



Ana Mendieta, *Imágen de Yágul*, 1973. From the series *Siluetas Works in Mexico 1973-1977*; the Estate of Ana Mendieta Collection, LLC

It is rooted in a space and always specific to that space: some form and timing of caring might be ineffective if applied to a different 'space of care'. Ecological care requires relating the place – whether it is some soil, a mountain or a tree – through 'thoughtful and protracted observation'[1] to understand its needs and necessities, and to formulate caring practices adapted to its peculiarity and characteristics before acting upon it.

Eventually such relation draws into situating oneself within the space of care, rather than above; and this necessarily creates entangled exchanges between the carer and the cared for.

It is flexible, as care can act on multiple cyclical timescales through the performance of the practices which are reiterated and repetitive, somewhat regular but never really identical.

In the environmental assemblages of our Earth systems we cohabit multiple circular timescales. Such timescales, short and long, however cyclical, do not occur in exactly the same way: cycles are skewed and stretched by external factors – like changes in the weather patterns – bearing at every new cycle a degree of unexpectedness and indeterminacy; new conditions to which the performance of care must adapt to, thus being transformed.



Environmental care holds all the multiple paces and timescales of a landscape as a complex whole, precisely in the repetition and the performances of the practices of caring. Practices able to constantly re-produce the land, evolving at the same rhythm as it transforms.

Such example of rootedness and flexibility can be a foundation to inquire into new, non-exclusive models for protection and preservation of the environment; to move away from preservation and towards the practical implications of Environmental Care.

More thoughts:

- Maria Puig de la Bellacasa, *Matters of care, speculative ethics in more than human worlds* (2017)
- Vandana Shiva & Maria Mies, *Ecofeminism* (1993)
- Donna Haraway, *Anthropocene, Capitalocene, Plantationocene, Chthulucene: Making Kin* (2015)
- Rory Sherlock, *All is Flux: Memory and the Complex Whole* (Volume 55, July 2019. volumeproject.org)

[1] TAPO is a concept borrowed from permaculture. In Maria Puig de la Bellacasa, *Matters of Care*

Event acknowledgements

All the collaborators: Amanda Thomson; Andrew Patrizio; Anu Ranawana; George Revill; Lisa Garforth; Ruth Little; Stephen Ball, Susan Trangmar and the group from sensingsite at Central St Martins; and Vanessa Lastrucci. Tim Collins, Gavin MacGregor, Tim Waterman for their input on shaping the event and suggestions for collaborators. Donna Haraway and Duke University Press for kind permission to use Donna's book title for the event. Brandon Ballongée for kind permission to use a piece from his work 'Ghosts of the Gulf' as the event image. Volunteers from the Bartlett School of Architecture for help on the day, and the team at Friends House.

Thank you to all!